

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

KEVIN EFAW, )  
Plaintiff, ) 07-CV-00598  
vs. ) Philadelphia, PA  
FALLS TOWNSHIP, ) April 3, 2009  
Defendant. )

TRANSCRIPT OF CIVIL JURY TRIAL  
BEFORE THE HONORABLE M. FAITH ANGELL,  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff:

JEFFREY R. LESSIN, ESQUIRE  
MARK T. RICHTER, ESQUIRE  
Jeffrey R. Lessin & Associates  
Two Penn Center  
Suite 600  
1500 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19102

For the Defendants:

DAVID P. KARAMESSINIS, ESQUIRE  
CHRISTINE E. MUNION, ESQUIRE  
Law Offices of  
William J. Ferren & Associates  
10 Sentry Parkway  
Suite 301  
Blue Bell, Pennsylvania 19422

Audio Operator:

INNA GOLDSHTEYN

Transcribed by:

DIANA DOMAN TRANSCRIBING  
P. O. Box 129  
Gibbsboro, New Jersey 08026  
Off: (856) 435-7172  
Fax: (856) 435-7124  
E-mail: [dianadoman@comcast.net](mailto:dianadoman@comcast.net)

Proceedings recorded by electronic sound recording; transcript produced by transcription service.

I\_N\_D\_E\_XTHE COURT:

Jury Questions 3

THE JURY:

Verdict 7

Please note: Some speaker identification not noted on log.

Also, sidebars were too inaudible to put under separate cover.

1                             (The following was held in open court at 8:42 a.m.)

2                             CLERK: -- Faith Angell presiding.

3                             THE COURT: Okay. You're all here. (Pause). We  
4 have some questions. Okay. Question number one, "Can we have  
5 an easel and markers?" I'll have to look around. My other  
6 courtroom had them. I'm sure we can find them. Question  
7 number two, "Can we have some coffee and soda?"

8                             COUNSEL: I would say no to the second question.

9                             THE COURT: Do you want a verdict?

10                            COUNSEL: And, we want them to be told --

11                            THE COURT: No food, no drink, no nothing. Three,  
12 "Original police reports, use of force of reports, and incident  
13 reports." You'll have to go through the exhibits.

14                            Four, "definitions or clarifications of assault,  
15 battery, and resisting arrest." I thought I had that in my --  
16 in my instructions.

17                            MR. KARAMESSINIS: Not resisting arrest.

18                            MS. MUNION: No.

19                            THE COURT: No resisting arrest.

20                            MR. KARAMESSINIS: Well, can they have then --

21                            MS. MUNION: It's in --

22                            THE COURT: I can --

23                            MR. KARAMESSINIS: -- the guilty plea?

24                            MS. MUNION: It's in the exhibit. It's in one of the  
25 exhibits, David.

1 MR. LESSIN: It's in the guilty plea.

2 MS. MUNION: Number 7.

3 THE COURT: Okay. Fine, whatever. "Photocopies of  
4 the jury instructions so one -- so we can each read one more --  
5 we can read more at a time." Sure. I'll make individual jury  
6 instructions.

7 COUNSEL: D-7 is the --

8 THE COURT: D-7. Okay.

9 COUNSEL: -- guilty plea.

10 THE COURT: You can bring them in.

11 MS. MUNION: The what?

12 COUNSEL: Guilty plea.

13 (Pause) .

14 MR. KARAMESSINIS: Judge, what was it that they --  
15 they wanted a police --

16 MR. LESSIN: Incident reports --

17 MR. KARAMESSINIS: -- incident report, --

18 THE COURT: Yes.

19 MR. KARAMESSINIS: -- like, all of them?

20 THE COURT: Yes.

21 MR. KARAMESSINIS: Okay. And, the use of force  
22 reports?

23 THE COURT: Yes.

24 MR. KARAMESSINIS: Okay. I'll get them out of -- out  
25 of Jeff's --

1 (Jury enters)

2 THE COURT: Members of the jury, please be seated. I  
3 have -- I have this morning's questions. "Can we have an easel  
4 and markers?" "Can we have coffee and some soda?" Leslie is  
5 brewing coffee, and we'll get soda. "The original police  
6 reports, use of force reports, and incident reports", yes.

7                             "Definitions or clarifications of assault, battery,  
8 and resisting arrest." What we will give you is D-7, which is  
9 the guilty plea. And, in the guilty plea, it explains all  
10 those charges.

11 Photocopies of the jury instructions so everybody  
12 each has a copy, sure. Okay?

13 MR. KARAMESSINIS: Judge, may we --

14 THE COURT: Yes?

15 MR. KARAMESSINIS: -- can we please have a quick  
16 sidebar just before they go out?

17 (Sidebar under seal)

24 And, then, when you say original, what we have are  
25 original copies in effect, because the -- the actual court in

1 the counties keeps their originals. So, you'll have legible  
2 copied originals as you have phrased it. Okay. I just want to  
3 make sure that no one discussed this matter with anybody  
4 outside of your group. (Pause). Very good. Thank you very  
5 much. Okay.

6 (Jury leaves)

7 (Recess from 8:47 a.m. until 11:25 a.m.)

8 CLERK: All rise. Court is now in session.

9 THE COURT: Counsel, they have a question. "Is there  
10 a K-9 policy? If so, can we have a copy?" What's the exhibit  
11 number for the K-9 policy?

12 MR. KARAMESSINIS: It's D-9.

13 THE COURT: I thought we just gave them D-9.

14 MR. KARAMESSINIS: No.

15 THE COURT: Oh, no, we gave them D-7. It's D-9?

16 MR. KARAMESSINIS: Yes.

17 THE COURT: Okay. Bring them in.

18 (Jury enters)

19 THE COURT: Thank you. You've asked, "Is there a K-9  
20 policy. If so, can we have a copy?" Yes, there is, and yes  
21 you can. Leslie, do you want to give us -- it's K-9, is that  
22 correct?

23 CLERK: D-9.

24 THE COURT: D-9. Okay. Thank you.

25 (Recess from 11:27 a.m. until 1:17 p.m.)

1                   THE COURT:  Jurors, have you reached a verdict?

2                   FOREPERSON:  Yes.

3                   THE COURT:  Fine.  Can you -- Leslie will pick up  
4 your form.

5                   CLERK:  Members of the jury, have you agreed upon  
6 your verdict by answering the interrogatories submitted to you  
7 by the Court?

8                   FOREPERSON:  Yes.

9                   CLERK:  What is your answer to interrogatory number  
10 1, which reads, "Did defendant Police Officer Henry Ward,  
11 violate plaintiff's Fourth Amendment right by the use of  
12 excessive force?"

13                  FOREPERSON:  Yes.

14                  CLERK:  What is your answer to interrogatory number  
15 2, which reads, "Did defendant Police Officer Jeffrey Rhodunda  
16 violate plaintiff's Fourth Amendment right by the use of  
17 excessive force?"

18                  FOREPERSON:  No.

19                  CLERK:  Number 3, "Did defendant Police Officer  
20 Edward Elmore violate plaintiff's Fourth Amendment right by the  
21 use of the excessive force?"

22                  FOREPERSON:  No.

23                  CLERK:  And, what is your answer to number 4, which  
24 reads, "Did defendant Police Officer Steve Langan violate  
25 plaintiff's Fourth Amendment right by the use of excessive

1 force?"

2 FOREPERSON: No.

3 CLERK: What is your answer to interrogatory number  
4 5, which reads, "If plaintiff's Fourth Amendment right was  
5 violated, was the violation proximately caused by the  
6 implementation of Falls Township's K-9 policy?"

7 FOREPERSON: Yes.

8 CLERK: What is your answer to interrogatory number  
9 6, which reads, "Did Police Officer Henry Ward unlawfully  
10 assault plaintiff?"

11 FOREPERSON: No.

12 CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
13 number 7, which reads, "Did Police Officer Jeffrey Rhodunda  
14 unlawfully assault plaintiff?"

15 FOREPERSON: No.

16 CLERK: And, your answer to number 8, "Did Police  
17 Officer Edward Elmore unlawfully assault plaintiff?"

18 FOREPERSON: No.

19 CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
20 number 9, which reads, "Did Police Officer Steve Langan  
21 unlawfully assault plaintiff?"

22 FOREPERSON: No.

23 CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
24 number 10, which reads, "Did Police Officer Henry Ward commit  
25 an unlawful battery on the plaintiff?"

1                   FOREPERSON: No.

2                   CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
3                   number 11, "Did Police Officer Jeffrey Rhodunda commit an  
4                   unlawful battery on the plaintiff?"

5                   FOREPERSON: No.

6                   CLERK: And, your answer to interrogatory number 12,  
7                   "Did Police Officer Edward Elmore commit an unlawful battery on  
8                   the plaintiff?"

9                   FOREPERSON: No.

10                  CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
11                  number 13, "Did Police Officer Steve Langan commit an unlawful  
12                  battery on the plaintiff?"

13                  FOREPERSON: No.

14                  CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
15                  number 14, "What is the total amount of compensatory damages  
16                  you award to plaintiff as a result of the actions of defendants  
17                  that caused injury to the plaintiff? Police Officer Ward?"

18                  FOREPERSON: Zero.

19                  CLERK: Police Officer Rhodunda?

20                  FOREPERSON: Zero.

21                  CLERK: Police Officer Elmore?

22                  FOREPERSON: Zero.

23                  CLERK: Police Officer Langan?

24                  FOREPERSON: Zero.

25                  CLERK: Falls Township?

1 FOREPERSON: 25,000.

2 CLERK: And, what is your answer to interrogatory  
3 number 15, which reads, "Do you assess punitive damages against  
4 the police officer defendants? Police Officer Ward?"

5 FOREPERSON: Yes.

6 CLERK: And, how -- the amount?

7 FOREPERSON: 5,000.

8 CLERK: Police Officer Rhodunda?

9 FOREPERSON: No.

10 CLERK: Police Officer Elmore?

11 FOREPERSON: No.

12 CLERK: Police Officer Langan?

13 FOREPERSON: No. Members of the jury, hearken unto  
14 your verdict in the issue joined wherein Kevin Efaw is  
15 plaintiff and Falls Township, Police Officer Henry Ward, Police  
16 Officer Jeffrey Rhodunda, Police Officer Edward Elmore, and  
17 Police Officer Steve Langan are defendants. You have answered  
18 the interrogatories as follows.

19 Interrogatory number 1, yes; number 2, no; number 3,  
20 no; number 4, no; number 5, yes; number 6, no; number 7, no;  
21 number 8, no; number 9, no; number 10, no; number 11, no;  
22 number 12, no; number 13, no.

23 The total amount of compensatory damages you awarded  
24 in interrogatory number 14 reads Police Officer Ward, zero;  
25 Police Officer Rhodunda, zero; Police Officer Elmore, zero;

1                   Police Officer Langan, zero; and Falls Township, \$25,000.

2                   And, the punitive damages you assessed against the  
3 police officer defendants in interrogatory number 15 are Police  
4 Officer Ward, -- you found punitive damages in the amount of  
5 \$5,000; Police Office Rhodunda, there were no punitive damages;  
6 Police Officer Elmore, no; and Police Officer Langan, no. And,  
7 so say you all.

8                   FOREPERSON: Yes.

9                   THE COURT: Polling?

10                  MR. KARAMESSINIS: Yes.

11                  THE COURT: Okay. They want to be -- he wants them  
12 polled.

13                  CLERK: Oh, I'm sorry. You do want them polled.  
14 Juror number 1, is the verdict of your foreperson your true and  
15 correct verdict?

16                  JUROR 1: Yes, it is.

17                  CLERK: Juror number 2, is the verdict of your  
18 foreperson the true and correct verdict?

19                  JUROR 2: Yes.

20                  CLERK: Juror number 3, is the verdict of your  
21 foreperson your true and correct verdict?

22                  JUROR 3: Yes.

23                  CLERK: Is the verdict of your foreperson, juror  
24 number 4, your true and correct verdict?

25                  JUROR 4: Yes.

1 CLERK: Juror number 5, is the verdict of your  
2 foreperson your true and correct verdict?

3 JUROR 5: Yes.

4 CLERK: Juror number 6, is the verdict of your  
5 foreperson your true and correct verdict?

6 JUROR 6: Yes.

7 CLERK: Juror number 7, is the verdict of your  
8 foreperson your true and correct verdict?

9 JUROR 7: Yes.

10 CLERK: And, juror number 8, is the verdict of your  
11 foreperson your true and correct verdict?

12 JUROR 8: Yes.

13 THE COURT: Jurors, thank you very much. You have  
14 completed your responsibility. We are grateful. Counsel are  
15 also grateful that this matter has been terminated by a  
16 verdict. And, I thank you very much. You are excused. I do  
17 not permit counsel to interview the jurors unless they so  
18 choose. Thank you. You're free to go.

19 MR. RICHTER: Your Honor, may we have a sidebar  
20 before the jurors are excused?

THE COURT: Excuse me?

22 MR. RICHTER: May we have a sidebar before the jurors  
23 are excused?

24 THE COURT: All right.

25 (Sidebar under seal)

1 THE COURT: Again, jurors, you are dismissed. Thank  
2 you so much.

3 (Jury excused)

4                   THE COURT: Counsel, this has been a labor. I will  
5 expect post-trial motions dealing with what is represented to  
6 be an inconsistent verdict within -- 10 days, 20 days -- 10  
7 days.

8

9 (Proceedings concluded at 1:32 p.m.)

\* \* \* \*

## C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Frances L. Maristch, court approved transcriber,  
certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript from the  
official electronic sound recording of the proceedings in the  
above-entitled matter.

DATE

## FRANCES L. MARISTCH